

THE PHILOSOPHER AND THE BAT

"Can I know what it is like to be X?"

Tell me the criteria for knowing what it is like to be X, and I will give you an answer.

"Alright. You know what it is like if you can imagine what it is like to be X."

Tell me the criteria for imagining what it is like to be X, and I will give you an answer.

"...If you have had experiences similar to those of X."

Tell me the criteria for experiences being similar to those of X, and I will give you an answer.

"...If I've had the same experience. Similarity is simple identity."

Tell me the criteria for having the same, identical experience, and I will give you an answer.

"...If I've had THIS and they've had THIS, then I can know or imagine what it is like to be X!"

Tell me the criteria for having THIS, and I will give you an answer.

"You are completely inscrutable."

Tell me the criteria for being completely inscrutable, and I will give you an answer.

PHILIP BOLD